

Human Resources Committee

March 6, 2013

The **Human Resources Committee** met Wednesday, March 6, 2013, at 12:00 p.m. in the Conference Room at City Hall. Present were Committee Chairperson John Uden, Committee Members Bill Melnik, Mark Ahner and Roxanna Brush. Also present were Councilpersons John Hollowell, Jerry Partridge and Sue Galbraith, Mayor C.A. Grenz, Finance Clerk Linda Wildman, Police Chief Doug Colombik, Fire Chief Dale Berg, Flood Administrator Sam Malenovsky, Public Utilities Director Al Kelm, Program Administrator Dawn Colton, Community Service Planner Dianna Broadie and Committee Recorder HR/Payroll Officer Billie Burkhalter.

1. Roll Call

- Noted above

2. Review job description of Dianna Larson

Chairperson Uden explained that Dianna Larson could not attend this meeting and this item will be moved to a future agenda.

3. Discussion with Department Heads regarding Performance Evaluations for their employees

Chairperson Uden explained that Mayor Grenz, with City Attorney Rice present, completed all Department Head Performance Evaluations.

Chairperson Uden stated he was quite shocked that most City employees have never had a job performance evaluation. He understands that the Fire and Police departments have either completed evaluations or are in the process of completing them. Director Kelm stated he had not done evaluations in a very long time mainly due to Union 283A being opposed to evaluations being completed. He further explained that in the past 283A perceived this process as being hostile and refused to sign the documents. Director Kelm believes that the employees now would be more open to participating in this process. Committee Member Melnik pointed out that a job performance evaluation is used as a learning tool and should not be perceived as a threat.

Councilperson Galbraith questioned if there was a standard evaluation form or if the Directors could use any form. HR Officer Burkhalter stated that there is an evaluation policy but there is not a standard form in the policy to use. Fire Chief Berg presented an Employee Performance Evaluation form that had been given to him in the past. Chairperson Uden reviewed this form and found it to be acceptable as it was a generic form that could be used by any Department Director. Committee Member Ahner agreed, and further stated that the Employee Performance Self Evaluation is an asset to the evaluation process.

- **** *Committee Member Ahner moved to recommend to Council to adopt the Employee Performance Evaluation form and the Employee Performance Self Evaluation form for use for this current year. Motion seconded by Committee Member Melnik.*

Chief Colombik explained the Police department uses their own evaluation forms due to the complexity of their jobs. Mayor Grenz recommended to the Committee that due to the Police department having different needs than most departments that Chief Colombik remains using what their department has established.

- **** *Committee Member Ahner amended the motion to exclude the Police Department from having to utilize these forms. Motion seconded by Committee Member Melnik. Upon roll call vote, motion was passed unanimously.*
- **** *Upon original motion and on roll call vote, motion was passed unanimously.*
- **** *Chairperson Uden moved to recommend to Council that all City employees have a completed Performance Evaluation within 2 months. Motion seconded by Committee Member Brush. Upon roll call vote, motion passed unanimously.*

Chairperson Uden explained to the Committee that he will meet with City Attorney Rice to establish a policy on City wide job performance evaluations and will present it at the next scheduled meeting.

4. Consider hiring procedures as provided by the Mayor

Mayor Grenz explained he had City's Labor Negotiator Larry Martin review the City Personnel Policy manual and write for him a new hiring procedure policy. When he received the information from Attorney Martin, he stated it was so full of legalese that he decided to forward it to Dan Clark with MSU Local Government Center with a request to provide him a workable outline form. Mayor Grenz stated he was given some choices in the Local Government's outline, such as, having the Department heads do the hiring or the Mayor, and he selected to do it himself. Mayor Grenz stated that there is nothing new in the proposed hiring procedures it will just make it a lot easier and simpler to follow and is in line with City policy.

Committee Member Ahner questioned HR Officer Burkhalter as to whether this conformed to the current policy and if there were minor changes made. HR Officer Burkhalter replied that what was introduced was a good policy but would need clarification on a few things. The first being questioned is under the Hiring Process, concerning job description modification. She stated she was confused as this seems to refer to current employees' job descriptions and felt this didn't belong in this particular policy. She recommended it states future city employees. Committee Member Ahner agreed that it should state "potential" employees.

HR Officer Burkhalter further explained that under the Hiring Process where it referenced to collective bargaining agreements was not concise enough. She recommended that the current policy language be kept as the City is required to follow contract language to the extent applicable. She further explained she had been given two similar documents concerning the new hiring procedures, one from Mayor Grenz and the other from Local Government Center.

HR Officer Burkhalter questioned what the Committee's intention is on the existing policy, would the new procedures replace it or be combined into it. Mayor Grenz stated it was his understanding that these procedures would be in addition to the existing policy. Committee Member Brush stated she did not believe this would work as an addendum due to the documents saying two different things. She referenced the existing policy states Department Heads do the hiring; this would need to be changed.

- **** *Committee Member Brush made a motion to update the City's current hiring procedure policy with the bullets from the City's Labor Attorney included in it. Motion seconded by Committee Member Ahner.*

Councilperson Hollowell stated the proposed hiring policy does clarify some issues with the existing policy, but feels there are still questions that need to be addressed. Specifically under "Recruitment and Selection Policies" under #2; internal recruitment, where it states the "City reserves the right to open all job searches outside the organization". Councilperson Hollowell explained that he spoke with Deputy City Attorney Erica Griffith and questioned her on whom and what is considered the "City". She recommended that this be replaced with the "Mayor" to stay in line with the procedures. He also questioned #3; "open recruitment process", as he understands it, the open positions will start with the job registry, internal recruitment, external recruitment and once this is completed an applicant will be hired. Councilperson Hollowell would also like further clarification on who establishes the "hiring committee" and noted that Attorney Martin had recommended this be embodied in an updated recruitment policy.

Committee Member Ahner recommended HR Officer Burkhalter rework the existing policy incorporating the points of the proposed hiring procedures, and bring it back to the Committee for their review.

- **** *Committee Member Brush amended the motion to create a rough draft of the Hiring Procedures to be brought back to the Committee. Motion seconded by Committee Member Ahner. Upon roll call vote, motion was passed unanimously.*

- **** *Upon original motion and on roll call vote, motion was passed unanimously.*

Clerk Wildman questioned which form HR Officer Burkhalter would be using for integrating the policy, the one provided by the Mayor or Local Government Center. Chairperson Uden and the Committee were in agreement that both forms would be used. Chairperson Uden requested HR Officer Burkhalter inform the Committee when

this has been completed.

5. Request of Citizens

Administrator Malenovsky questioned what was going on with the mediation for the grievances. Committee Member Brush stated that she has been contacted by Attorney Martin and mediation has been scheduled for Monday, March 11, 2013 at 10:30 am in the Fish, Wildlife and Parks building in Miles City. Administrator Malenovsky pointed out that since she did not have an attorney, would her mediation be at the same time as the other employees who do? Chairperson Uden recommended Administrator Malenovsky meet with the Human Resource Officer on how to proceed.

6. Committee Members' comments


Committee Member Ahner stated in reference to the deferred item of Dianna Larson's job description, it should be reviewed by her supervisor prior to her bringing it to the Committee. Chairperson Uden questioned if Director Kelm had written or reviewed Dianna Larson's proposed job description. Director Kelm replied he had not written it and had only reviewed part of it. Chairperson Uden stated that the Committee would not address this issue until Director Kelm had approved the job description and brought it back to the Committee.

7. Adjournment

****** *Committee Member Brush moved to adjourn the meeting. The motion was seconded by Committee Member Melnik and passed.*

The meeting was adjourned at 12:55 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,


Billie D. Burkhalter, Recorder


Chairperson John Uden

HUMAN RESOURCES COMMITTEE AGENDA

DATE: Wednesday, March 6, 2013

TIME: 12:00 Noon

PLACE: City Hall Conference Room

AGENDA:

- 1) Roll Call
- 2) Review job description of Dianna Larson
- 3) Discussion with Department Heads regarding Performance Evaluations for their employees
- 4) Consider hiring procedures as provided by the Mayor
- 5) Citizen Request
- 6) Committee members' comments
- 7) Adjournment

Public comment on any public matter that is not on the agenda of this meeting can be presented under "Request of Citizens" provided it is within the jurisdiction of the City to address. Public comment will be entered into the minutes of this meeting. The City Council cannot take any action on the matter unless notice of the matter has been made on an agenda and an opportunity for public comment has been allowed on the matter. Public matter does not include contested cases and other adjudicative proceedings.

Duties of the Mayor:

- ✓ Appoint members of City Boards, **with consent** of the City Council
- ✓ Appoint members of advisory boards – **consent not needed** by the City Council
- ✓ Appoint all City department heads, **with consent of the majority** of the City Council
- ✓ Appoint and remove all other department employees – **consent not needed** by the City Council
- ✓ Different rules exist for the firefighters and police

Recruitment and Selection Policies:

1. Open positions **start with job registry for employees who have been laid off.** Qualified, laid off employees receive the highest level of preference for filling openings, but do not have exclusive hiring rights.
 2. Next, **internal recruitment** for current city employees. City reserves the right to open all job searches outside the organization. Qualified internal applicants will be considered, but being an internal applicant is not exclusive criteria for selection.
 3. Finally, **open recruitment process.**
- ✓ All advertisements must be reviewed and approved by Mayor prior to placement.
 - ✓ City hiring policy includes screening applications, personal interviews of selected candidates, checking references, and employment confirmation.
 - ✓ No employee **other than the Mayor** can modify the conditions to a job offer or enter into any agreement with a job applicant. **Mayor finalizes the appointment by sending a letter of confirmation (signed by Mayor).**
 - ✓ **Mayor retains final say-so** on who is hired (City Ordinance).

Hiring Process:

- ✓ Miles City Code has the **Mayor finalizing appointments via a letter of confirmation.**
- ✓ **If Mayor wants to make all employee appointments, Mayor should be part of screening and interviewing and review all information from applicants.**
- ✓ **Or, a hiring committee, appointed by the Mayor can move through all the steps, make a hiring recommendation to the Mayor, and provide the Mayor with the pertinent information. Mayor would then make the final decision, but applicants should be made aware of this through the process. This should be “embodied in an updated recruitment policy”.**
- ✓ **An individual is not formally hired by the City until the Mayor signs the payroll request form, a confirmation letter, or some document signifying the appointment.**
- ✓ The Human Resources Committee reviews job descriptions, approves, and revises them. You may adopt a policy that advises City employees that job descriptions may be modified during their period of employment. All applicants should be notified of alterations to job descriptions to be sure they wish to continue with the application process.
- ✓ Collective bargaining agreements usually do not commence until an employee is actually hired.

To: Mayor Grenz

From: Betsy Webb, SPHR, MSU Local Government Center

RE: Summary Bullets from Laurence Martin, City Attorney, communication dated 1/22/2013

Duties of Mayor:

- ✓ Appoint members of City Boards, **with consent** of the City Council
- ✓ Appoint members of advisory boards – **consent not needed** by the City Council
- ✓ Appoint all City department heads, **with consent of the majority** of the City Council
- ✓ Appoint and remove all other department employees – **consent not needed** by the City Council
- ✓ Different rules exist for firefighters and police

Recruitment and Selection Policies:

1. Open positions **start with job registry for employees who have been laid off**. Qualified, laid off employees receive the highest level of preference for filling openings, but do not have exclusive hiring rights.
 2. Next, **internal recruitment** for current city employees. City reserves right to open all job searches outside the organization. Qualified internal applicants will be considered, but being an internal applicant is not exclusive criteria for selection.
 3. Finally, **open recruitment process**.
- ✓ All advertisements **must be reviewed and approved by Mayor prior to placement**.
 - ✓ City hiring policy includes screening applications, personal interviews of selected candidates, checking references, and employment confirmation.
 - ✓ No employee **other than the Mayor** can modify the conditions to a job offer or enter into any agreement with a job applicant. **Mayor finalizes the appointment by sending a letter of confirmation (signed by Mayor)**.
 - ✓ Mayor retains final **say-so** on who is hired (City Ordinance).

Hiring Process:

- ✓ Mayor can delegate the recruitment process to a department head to manage the screening process, conduct interviews with a committee, and select the best applicant. But Miles City Code has the **Mayor finalizing appointments via a letter of confirmation**.
- ✓ If Mayor wants to make all employee appointments, Mayor should be part of screening and interviewing and review all information from applicants.

- ✓ Or, a hiring committee can move through all the steps, make a hiring recommendation to the Mayor, and provide the Mayor with the pertinent information. Mayor would then make the final decision, but applicants should be made aware of this through the process. This should be “embodied in an updated recruitment policy.”
- ✓ If the Mayor wants to give authority to a department head to make a final decision on a hire, Miles City policies should be updated to reflect this.
- ✓ An individual is not formally hired by the City until the Mayor signs the payroll request form, a confirmation letter, or some other document signifying the appointment.
- ✓ The attorney could not find any city policies regarding job description modification. Currently, the Human Resources Committee reviews job descriptions, approves, and revises them. If there is no policy, you may adopt one that advises City employees that job descriptions may be modified during their period of employment. All applicants should be notified of alterations to job descriptions to be sure they wish to continue with the application process.
- ✓ Remember to check any collective bargaining agreements you have, but they usually do not commence until an employee is actually hired.

EMPLOYEE PERFORMANCE EVALUATION

Name _____ Date _____

Dept. _____ Job Title _____

Check one: Annual New Employee Termination Other _____

Date of Last Review: _____ Date Employee Began Present Position: _____

Next Scheduled Review: _____

	U	F	S	G	E	Comments
1. Job Understanding: Employee possesses a clear knowledge of the responsibilities and the task he/she must perform.						
2. Job Performance: The neatness, thoroughness and accuracy of employee's work.						
3. Job Productivity: The quality of the employee's work in terms of volume and accomplishments.						
4. Dependability: Can you rely on this individual in terms of being on time and completion of tasks.						
5. Cooperation: The ability to work willingly with associates, subordinates, supervisors and others.						
6. Overall Rating						

7. General comments as to employee's strengths, weaknesses and action taken to improve job performance _____

Supervisor _____ Reviewing Officer _____

Date _____ Date _____

Has this report been discussed w/employee? Yes
 No, If not, why? _____

_____ If yes, note employee's comments _____

Employee's Signature _____ Date Reviewed w/Employee _____

EMPLOYEE PERFORMANCE SELF EVALUATION

NAME _____ DATE _____

JOB TITLE _____

1. Describe your job responsibilities/duties as you understand them:

2. In performing your job, what do you believe are your strongest points?

3. In what areas do you feel you need further improvement?

4. What Company action would be helpful to you in making improvement?

5. Name other job positions in the Company that you might have an interest in:

6. Suggestions/Comments:

EMPLOYEE SIGNATURE: _____ DATE: _____

RECEIVED BY: _____ DATE: _____

COMPANY REPRESENTATIVE (PRINT)

SIGNATURE: _____

DATE: _____ COPY GIVEN TO EMPLOYEE

To: Mayor Grenz

From: Betsy Webb, SPHR, MSU Local Government Center

RE: Summary Bullets from Laurence Martin, City Attorney, communication dated 1/22/2013

Duties of Mayor:

- ✓ Appoint members of City Boards, **with consent** of the City Council
- ✓ Appoint members of advisory boards – **consent not needed** by the City Council
- ✓ Appoint all City department heads, **with consent of the majority** of the City Council
- ✓ Appoint and remove all other department employees – **consent not needed** by the City Council
- ✓ Different rules exist for firefighters and police

Recruitment and Selection Policies:

1. Open positions **start with job registry for employees who have been laid off**. Qualified, laid off employees receive the highest level of preference for filling openings, but do not have exclusive hiring rights.
 2. Next, **internal recruitment** for current city employees. City reserves right to open all job searches outside the organization. Qualified internal applicants will be considered, but being an internal applicant is not exclusive criteria for selection.
 3. Finally, **open recruitment process**.
-
- ✓ All advertisements **must be reviewed and approved by Mayor prior to placement**.
 - ✓ City hiring policy includes screening applications, personal interviews of selected candidates, checking references, and employment confirmation.
 - ✓ No employee **other than the Mayor** can modify the conditions to a job offer or enter into any agreement with a job applicant. **Mayor finalizes the appointment by sending a letter of confirmation (signed by Mayor)**.
 - ✓ **Mayor retains final say-so** on who is hired (City Ordinance).

Hiring Process:

- ✓ **Mayor can delegate** the recruitment process to a department head to manage the screening process, conduct interviews with a committee, and select the best applicant. But Miles City Code has the **Mayor finalizing appointments via a letter of confirmation**.
- ✓ **If Mayor wants to make all employee appointments, Mayor should be part of screening and interviewing and review all information from applicants.**

- ✓ Or, a hiring committee can move through all the steps, make a hiring recommendation to the Mayor, and provide the Mayor with the pertinent information. Mayor would then make the final decision, but applicants should be made aware of this through the process. This should be “embodied in an updated recruitment policy.”
- ✓ If the Mayor wants to give authority to a department head to make a final decision on a hire, Miles City policies should be updated to reflect this.
- ✓ An individual is not formally hired by the City until the Mayor signs the payroll request form, a confirmation letter, or some other document signifying the appointment.
- ✓ The attorney could not find any city policies regarding job description modification. Currently, the Human Resources Committee reviews job descriptions, approves, and revises them. If there is no policy, you may adopt one that advises City employees that job descriptions may be modified during their period of employment. All applicants should be notified of alterations to job descriptions to be sure they wish to continue with the application process.
- ✓ Remember to check any collective bargaining agreements you have, but they usually do not commence until an employee is actually hired.